

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Summary Table of Contents	v
Preface	ix
Acknowledgements	xi

Orientation and Framework

Introducing the PERM-To-Green-Card Path and the Players, Hurdles, and Traps You Are Likely to Encounter Along the Way	1
Introduction	1
Federal Agencies You Will Encounter and the Three Main Steps You Must Complete to Obtain Green Cards Through PERM	2
Main Things the Federal Agencies Look for at Each Major Step	2
PERM at DOL	2
I-140 Petition at USCIS	3
I-485 Application (or Consular Processing at DOS)	3
Employers, Employees, and Their Perspectives	4
“Employer”	4
Perspectives Within the “Employer”	4
Human Resources Personnel	4
Technical Manager	5
General Counsel	5
Perspectives of the Employee	5
Why Timing Is So Critical Throughout the PERM-to-Green-Card Effort	6
If You Misunderstand, Miscalculate, or Miss a Deadline, Your Case May Fail	6
Estimate Timing <i>Conservatively</i> to Improve Client Relations	6
Your Client’s Friend’s Case Always Goes Faster and Smoother	6
Find and Resolve All Major Problems <i>Early</i> in the Process	6
Together, DOL and USCIS/DOS Have “One Fist of Iron, the Other of Steel. If the Right One Don’t Get You, the Left One Will.”	7
Conclusion	8
Knowing What to Do and When to Do It: A Step-by-Step Guide to Successful PERM Labor Certification Practice	9
Introduction	12
Step 1: Collecting Information from the Client(s)	12
Scope and Terms of Engagement	12
Initial Contact	13
Getting Terms in Writing	13
Addressing and Clarifying Dual Representation	13
Strategy Discussion with Employer and Employee	14

General Company Information.....	14
Companies with Small Number of Employees; Employee Ownership; Familial Relationships	14
Employer's "Ability to Pay" Documentation.....	15
Layoffs.....	15
Full-Time and Permanent Job Offer.....	15
Foreign-National Employee Questionnaires.....	15
Biographical Information for Employee and Any Dependents	16
Foreign-National Employee Employment Verification Chart.....	16
Step 2: Analyzing Minimum Job Requirements and Employee Qualifications	16
"Real World" Job Requirements vs. PERM Job Requirements	16
Analyzing the Job Requirements	17
Guidelines for Employers.....	17
"Minimum" vs. "Preferred"	17
Quantifiable vs. Subjective	17
Potential RFI Triggers.....	17
"Normal" Requirements	17
Qualifying Experience with the PERM Employer	18
Combination of Occupations	18
Alternative Requirements.....	18
Carefully Analyzing the PERM Beneficiary's Qualifications.....	19
Ensuring Thoroughness in Reviewing the Experience of the PERM Beneficiary	19
PERM Beneficiary's Experience Gained While with the PERM Employer	20
General Rule.....	20
Three Exceptions.....	20
Education Gained While with the PERM Employer	20
Education, I-140 Petition, and Immigrant Visa Categories.....	21
EB-2 vs. EB-3	21
"Equivalent" Degree	21
Getting It in Writing—The "Experience" Questionnaire and the "Experience" Letters.....	22
Experience Questionnaire	22
The "Experience" Letters.....	22
Step 3: Prevailing Wage and Related Issues.....	23
Submitting the Prevailing Wage Request	23
2018 SOC Revisions.....	23
Worksites, Telecommuting, and Traveling Post-COVID.....	23
CBA, SCA, DBA, and Alternate Surveys	24
Reviewing the Prevailing Wage Determination	24
Options If Prevailing Wage Determination Is Unacceptable	24
Provide an Alternate Survey	24
Accept the Prevailing Wage Determination and Increase the Actual Wage Offered	25
Seek a Redetermination from DOL.....	25
Requesting a Challenge or Review of Wage Determination.....	26

Tips for Prevailing Wages	26
Before Recruitment: “Business Necessity” for Requirements That Are Not “Normal”	27
Step 4: Recruitment.....	27
Mandatory Recruitment for All Occupations (Nonprofessional and Professional).....	27
SWA Job Order	28
Notice of Filing.....	28
Additional Recruitment for “Professional” Occupations	29
Drafting PERM-Compliant Advertisements.....	30
Clarity: How Much Information Is Enough to Apprise U.S. Workers of the Job Opportunity?	30
Wage: If the Employer Includes the Wage, What If the PERM Beneficiary Earns More than the Prevailing Wage; Is It Still Okay to List Only the Prevailing Wage in the Advertisements?	31
Understatement: Aside from Wages, What Other Terms of Employment Might Be Considered “Less Favorable” than Those Offered to the PERM Beneficiary?	31
Timing of Recruitment Advertisements	31
Strategic Choice: Who Should Place Advertisements?	32
Attorney Oversees Advertisement Placement	32
Employer Oversees Advertisement Placement	33
Third Party Oversees Advertisement Placement.....	33
Prompt and Thorough Follow-up with Applicants	33
Recruitment Tips	34
Step 5: Post-Recruitment 30-Day “Quiet” Period.....	35
Completing the Audit File and Related Tasks	35
Reviewing Employer’s Preliminary Recruitment Results	36
Drafting and Ensuring Accuracy of the Form ETA-9089	36
Notes or Memo to Record Unusual Aspects of Case.....	37
30-Day “Quiet” Period Tips	37
Step 6: Filing Form ETA-9089	38
Prefiling Cleanup and Review	38
Employer Review and Approval of Final Recruitment Report	38
Employer Confirmation of No Layoffs	38
Final Review	39
Submission of Form ETA-9089 Through FLAG	39
Step 7: Postfiling Tasks	39
Step 8: Stay Abreast of Frequent DOL Changes	39
Resources You Will Use Frequently	40
The PERM Regulations, 20 CFR Parts 655 and 656.....	40
Board of Alien Labor Certification Appeals Decisions.....	40
PERM Processing Times.....	40
Occupation and Wage Research.....	40
Conclusion	41

Ethics in PERM: Where the Line Is and How to Draw It	43
Ethical Considerations in Initiating the Case.....	43
Ethical Considerations in Drafting the Job Description	44
What Are the Job Description Parameters in a PERM Labor Certification?.....	44
Who Should Drive the Process of Confirming the Job Description and Requirements?	46
What Is an Attorney's Role When an Employer's Job Description Is Less than Well Defined?	46
Ethical Considerations in PERM Recruitment Process	47
Recruitment Sources.....	47
Reviewing Applicants.....	48
Willing, Able, and Available	48
Diversion.....	49
Layoffs.....	50
Ethical Considerations and Document Retention	50
Ethics of Client Relationships: What to Do When You Have an Uncooperative Client	52
When to Call a Mentor.....	53

Case Intake, Screening, and Early Issue Spotting

Spotting Facts That Tell You That PERM Will Be Difficult or Impossible—and Seeking Ways to Address Such Difficulties	55
Introduction.....	55
Facts and Circumstances Indicating That Your Client's Case May Be a Dead End	55
The Offered Wage Falls Below the Anticipated Prevailing Wage	55
The Employer's Financial Documents Indicate That They Are Currently Very Weak Financially	56
Education/Experience Requirements Are Excessively Low in an Area of High Unemployment	57
Employer Insistence on Abnormally High Education and Experience Requirements	57
Employer Had Recent Layoffs	58
The Beneficiary Qualifies for the Position Only Through Substantially Different Alternate Requirements	58
The Beneficiary Does Not Have the Required Degree.....	58
The Beneficiary's Degree Fails to Meet USCIS Equivalency Standards.....	59
The Beneficiary Cannot Verify Prior Experience	59
The Beneficiary Lacks Required License	59
The Beneficiary Has Ownership or Familial Relationships with Sponsoring Employer	60
Anticipating and Addressing Client Reaction to Learning That Their Case Cannot Go Forward	61
Considering Alternatives to PERM.....	62
Hypothetical Fact Pattern for Analyzing the Most Common Potential Alternatives to PERM	62
Foreign Nationals with Extraordinary Ability (EB-1A)	63
Outstanding Professors or Researchers (EB-1B).....	63
National Interest Waiver (NIW)	64
Schedule A, Group II (Exceptional Ability)	64
Multinational Executives and Managers (EB-1C)	65

EB-5 Immigrant Investor Visa.....	65
Other Options to Explore and Consider at the Outset of the Case, If Applicable	66
Schedule A, Group I for Professional Nurses and Physical Therapists	66
Family- and Marriage-Based Immigration.....	67
Diversity Visa Lottery	67
Religious Workers	67
Asylum	67
Conclusion	67
Creating a Crystal Ball: Employer-Related Issues to Spot Before Commencing a PERM Case.....	69
Section I: Collecting Information About the Employer and Employee—Identifying Approvability and	
Discovering Potential Pitfalls	71
Timing the PERM Application: Strategic Considerations for Employers and Practitioners.....	72
Using the PERM Application as a Retention Tool	72
Beginning the PERM Process Early May Save the Employer Significant Costs in College and	
University Settings.....	73
A Timely Filed PERM Application Will Secure the Foreign Worker’s Ability to Maintain	
Work Authorization Until Permanent Resident Status Is Granted	73
Issues Associated with the Employer’s Corporate Information	74
Issue: The Employer’s Legal Name	74
Issue: Close Familial Relationships and Foreign Worker Ownership	74
Issue: Employer’s Number of Employees:	75
Issues Associated with the Employer’s Worksite Location: Multiple Worksites, Roving Employees,	
and Virtual/Home Offices.....	75
Issues Associated with the Wage Offered and Proving the Employer’s Ability to Pay	77
Issues Associated with the Offered Position.....	79
Issue: Job Title/Description and Anticipating the Standard Occupational	
Classification (SOC).....	79
Issue: Minimum Education and Experience Requirements.....	80
Issue: The Battle Between EB-2 and EB-3	81
Issue: Newly Created Positions	82
Issue: When Can Qualifying Experience Be Gained with the Same Employer?	82
Issue: Too Much of a Good Thing? Business Necessity and Job Requirement Scrutiny	83
Issue: Layoffs	84
Summary.....	84
Section II: Apprising Employers of Their Key Role, Obligations, and Commitment When Starting the	
PERM Process	84
What Should the Practitioner Tell the Employer?	85
The Employer’s Financial Obligations.....	85
The Employer’s Obligation to Pay for All Costs Associated with the Preparation and	
Filing of the PERM Application	85
The Employer’s Obligation to Pay the Foreign Worker (At Least) the Prevailing Wage	86
The Employer’s Role in Drafting the Job Description/Advertisement Text	86
The Employer’s Role in the Recruitment Process.....	88

The Employer's Role in Complying with the Mandatory Advertising and Notice Requirements.....	88
The Employer's Role in Reviewing Applications and Contacting All Applicants Who Appear to Be Minimally Qualified.....	89
The Employer's Obligation to Maintain the Compliance File	92
The Employer's Potential Liability If Sponsoring a Foreign Worker Without Proper Work Authorization.....	92
Conclusion	93
Employee-Related Issues to Spot Before Commencing a PERM Case	95
Section I: Identifying Potential Bases of Inadmissibility, Including Whether the Foreign Worker Is Subject to the "Bars".....	96
Issue: Fraud-Related Grounds of Inadmissibility	96
Issue: Criminal Grounds of Inadmissibility	98
Issue: Health-Related Grounds of Inadmissibility.....	99
Issue: Public Charge Ground of Inadmissibility	99
Issue: Foreign Worker Entered Without Inspection or Has Accrued Unlawful Presence Rendering Them Subject to the Three-Year, Ten-Year, or Permanent Bar	100
Section II: Identifying Possible Issues Relating to the Nonimmigrant Status of the Foreign Worker	101
Issue: Foreign Worker Is in H-1B Status and Subject to a Maximum Period of Stay.....	102
Issue: Foreign Worker Is an L-1 Intracompany Transferee Subject to a Maximum Period of Stay in the United States.....	103
Issue: Foreign Worker Is or Was an Exchange Visitor in J-1 Status, Subject to the Two-Year Home-Residency Requirement.....	104
Issue: Foreign Worker Is in Nonimmigrant Worker Status Pursuant to Free Trade Agreements—TN, E-3, H-1B1	105
Issue: Foreign Worker Is a Student in Nonimmigrant F-1 Status.....	106
Issue: Foreign Worker Is in Other Nonimmigrant Status	106
Section III: Identifying When Foreign Worker Will Be Able to Pursue Permanent Residence and Capturing, When Possible, an Earlier Priority Date	107
Issue: The Foreign Worker's Priority Date Based on the PERM Case to Be Filed.....	107
Issue: Foreign Worker Was the Beneficiary of a Previously Filed Labor Certification or Petition, or May Be "Portable"	108
Issue: Foreign Worker Can Be "Grandfathered" Under INA §245(i)	109
Section IV: Identifying Familial Issues	109
Issue: The Foreign Worker Is Single	109
Issue: The Foreign Worker's and Spouse's Country of Birth and "Cross-Chargeability"	110
The Nonimmigrant Status of the Foreign Worker's Spouse	110
Issue: The Foreign Worker's Child Will Reach the Age of 21 Before the Foreign Worker and Derivative Family Members Are Able to File I-485 Applications to Adjust Status.....	111
Conclusion	111

Defining the Job and Minimum Requirements

Identifying the Employer's Requirements for the Position Before Drafting an Approvable and Appropriate PERM Application	113
Prepare the Job Description	113
Determine the Appropriate O*NET Classification.....	114
Determine the Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) Classification.....	115
Does the Position Require a Foreign Language?	117
Does the Position Require Duties That Reflect a Combination of Occupations?.....	117
Can the Beneficiary Prove Qualifications for the Position?	118
Three-Year Degrees and Other Equivalency Issues	120
Degree in a Different Field	121
Appendix 1: Evidence of Qualifications.....	123
PERM Actual Minimum Requirements: When a Beneficiary Has Gained Required Experience, Training, or Education After Joining the Employer Filing the Application	125
Introduction.....	125
Mastering the Circuitry of Forms ETA-9141 and ETA-9089.....	126
No Errors	126
No Modification of Form ETA-9089 After Filing.....	127
Weaponizing Form ETA-9089	127
The Regulatory Framework: Actual Minimum Requirements	129
Complications Involving the Beneficiary's Experience and/or Training	133
When Some or All of the Beneficiary's Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained While Working for the Employer Filing the Labor Certification Application.....	133
Substantial Incomparability.....	133
Drafting Form ETA-9089 to Show Substantial Incomparability	134
Infeasibility to Train.....	138
When There Has Been a Break in the Beneficiary's Employment.....	140
When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained with a Predecessor or Related Entity	141
When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained After Joining the Employer, but with a Different Entity	142
When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained as a Contractor Working for the Entity Filing the Labor Certification Application	142
When the Beneficiary Has No Experience in the Position to Be Certified	143
Complications Involving the Beneficiary's Education	144
Conclusion	149

Hiring the Best Qualified Worker: PERM's "Infeasibility-to-Train" Exception	151
Introduction.....	151
Summary of Legislative Background	153
Infeasibility-to-Train Standards	154
Personnel Changes (Layoffs, Worker Attrition, Reductions in Force, Downsizing)	154
Changing Technological, Business, and Economic Circumstances	156
When Training Is Impossible and the Requirements Cannot Be Reduced.....	158
Documenting Infeasibility to Train	159
Conclusion	160
Combination of Occupations: New Challenges in PERM	161
Introduction.....	161
Combination of Occupations: Rules and Case Law.....	163
A Combination of What?.....	163
What Is the Next Step of Analysis Before the Employer Decides to Prepare the	
Documentation Justifying Its Combination of Occupations?	164
What Is the Standard for "Business Necessity" Applicable to Combinations of Occupations?.....	165
Conclusion	167
Documenting Business Necessity: The Employer's Statement, Supporting Documentation, and the	
New Form ETA-9089 Question G.9	169
The Information Industries Standard	170
The Business Necessity Summary: Completing Appendix C.....	170
Audit Response Documentation: The Employer's Statement.....	171
Preliminary Matters: Audience, Author, Format	171
Developing the Employer's Statement	172
Prong One: The Employer's Business	173
Prong One, Step Two: The Role of the Position in the Employer's Business.....	173
Prong Two: Relating the Requirements to the Duties	173
Audit Response Documentation: Other Supporting Documentation	175
Conclusion	176
Appendix A: Sample 1,500-Character Business Necessity Statement for Appendix C	
of Form ETA-9089	177
Appendix B: Sample Employer's Statement of Business Necessity in Response to an	
Audit Request.....	178
When and How Should Employers Use the <i>Kellogg</i> Language in PERM Applications?	181
Introduction.....	181
<i>Francis Kellogg</i> , Pre-PERM.....	182
Current <i>Kellogg</i> Standards.....	183
May the CO Deny an Application for Failure to State the <i>Kellogg</i> Language on	
Form ETA-9089?.....	184
When Is an Employer Not Subject to the <i>Kellogg</i> Language?	185
Which Requirements Are Not Considered "Substantially Equivalent"?.....	187
Conclusion	188

Prevailing Wage Analysis and Job Location

Prevailing Wages Under PERM: How to “Do the Right Thing”	191
Introduction.....	191
Identifying the Right Wage Source	192
Collective Bargaining Agreements, University Wage Scales, and Salaries for Athletes	192
The Davis-Bacon Act and Service Contract Act	192
100 Percent of Prevailing Wage	193
Private Surveys	193
Survey Criteria	194
Use of the Median	195
Continuation of Past Policies	196
BLS Is No Longer Available	196
Permissible Components of Compensation	196
Finding the Right Job Description or Classification	197
Shopping for an SOC Code	198
Locating the Right Level	200
Level 1 (Entry).....	201
Level 2 (Qualified)	201
Level 3 (Experienced).....	202
Level 4 (Fully Competent).....	202
The Levels Worksheet	203
Step 1: Find the Correct O*NET Code and Enter the Job’s Requirements	203
Step 2: Complete the Experience Section	204
Step 3: Complete the Education Section	205
Step 4: Complete the Special Skills and Other Requirements Section	206
Step 5: Complete Supervisory Duties Section	208
Final Step: Total the Points	209
Finding the Right Wage Level When the Employer Specifies Alternative Job Requirements	209
Finding the Right Location for the Roving Employee	209
Using the Right Form and Procedures	210
PWD Form Validity Date	213
Arguing for the Right Wage Determination—Creating an Appeal Record	214
BALCA Review	215
Using the Right PWD in an Audit Response.....	216
How to Prevent PWD Processing Delays from Ruining Your Case.....	216
Conclusion	216
Appendix A.....	217
Appendix B	218

Understanding SOC Codes: Why They Are Critical in the PERM Process	219
Introduction.....	219
What Is an SOC Code?	220
How to Determine the Correct SOC Code.....	221
Conclusion	221
Understanding SVP in PERM	223
The Difference Between SVP <i>Lapsed Time</i> and SVP <i>Level</i>	224
The Number of SVP Years Credited by Education	224
Associate's Degree and SVP	224
Bachelor's Degree and SVP	225
Master's and Doctoral Degrees and SVP	225
BALCA Case Law Regarding SVP	226
Cases Addressing SVP in Evaluating the Equivalency of Alternate Requirements.....	226
Cases Addressing SVP in Evaluating the Need to Demonstrate Business Necessity.....	228
Cases in Which SVP Analysis by BALCA and/or the CO Was All Wrong	228
Conclusion	229
Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) Levels.....	230
Educational Equivalents in SVP Years.....	230
O*Net Job Zone	231
Documenting Travel Requirements in the Age of Telecommuting and Workforce Mobility	233
Defining Travel Requirements.....	234
Telecommuting, Remote Work, Telehealth.....	235
Telehealth	236
Roving, Multiple Worksites, Relocation	237
Traveling and Commuting.....	237
BALCA Decisions	238
Conclusion	240

Recruitment Strategy and Execution

The Recruitment Process Under PERM	241
Introduction.....	241
Recruitment Procedures.....	242
PERM Recruitment in the Context of INA §274B and DOJ IER Enforcement.....	242
Recruitment Timeframe Calculations.....	243
Newspaper Advertisements	243
Selection of Newspapers of General Circulation.....	244
The Employer's Name.....	244
Where to Apply	245
The Job Description; Multiple Job Opportunities.....	245
Identifying the Geographic Area	246
Obtaining a Prevailing Wage and the Option of Including It in the Advertisement	247
Journal Advertisements	248

Placing a Job Order.....	248
Additional Recruitment Steps for Professional Positions.....	249
Aligning Additional PERM Recruitment with Non-PERM Hiring Practices	250
Notice of Filing Requirements.....	251
Avoid Duplicating Recruitment Methods.....	252
Third-Party Reposting, Job Aggregation, and “Scraping” of PERM Advertisements	252
Trust but Verify!	253
Conducting and Documenting Recruitment.....	253
The Recruitment Report	253
When an Employer Does Not Need to Reach Out to a Job Applicant; When Further Inquiry Is Required.....	254
Use of Artificial Intelligence in Screening PERM Applicants	255
What Constitutes a “Reasonable Period of On-the-Job Training”	256
Telephone Interviews and Written Questionnaires.....	257
The Timeliness and Manner of Contact	258
The Attorney’s Role in the PERM Recruitment Process.....	259
Practice Consideration: Good-Faith Recruitment in the Digital Environment.....	260
Conclusion	260
The 10 Additional Recruitment Steps for Professional Positions	261
Introduction.....	261
Advertisement Content	262
Job Fairs.....	263
Employer’s Website.....	263
Job Search Website Other than the Employer’s	264
On-Campus Recruiting	264
Trade or Professional Organizations	264
Private Employment Firms	265
Employee Referral Program with Incentives.....	265
Campus Placement Offices.....	266
Local and Ethnic Newspapers	266
Radio and Television Advertisements	267
Conclusion	267
To Batch or Not to Batch (The PERM Recruitment).....	269
So Many PERMs, So Little Time	269
“What Is Batching?”	269
Types of Job/Company Profiles That Best Benefit from Batch.....	270
How Do You Batch?	270
Benefits and Pitfalls of Batching	271
Benefits.....	271
Pitfalls.....	272
Pro Tips.....	272
Conclusion	273

The New Normal in PERM Recruitment: Compliance with State and Local Equal Pay Transparency Laws in Job Postings	275
Introduction and Scope	275
Refresher Overview of PERM Prevailing Wage, Advertising, and Notice Requirements.....	276
The Impact of State and Local Wage Transparency Laws on PERM Advertising and Notice of Filing Content.....	277
Rumor Control: The Concept of Federal Preemption.....	277
The New Job Posting Tug-of-War: Complying with Two Sets of Laws.....	278
Practice Methodology.....	279
All-in-One: EPT Laws with a Built-In Long-Arm Reach	279
Keeping it Simple: Suggested Best Practices for Compliance in PERM Recruitment and Notices of Filing	281
What PERM Steps?	281
What Wage Data?.....	281
What Ifs?	282
Final Practice Pointers.....	282
Conclusion	283
Layoff Provisions Under PERM	285
DOL's Pre-PERM Treatment of Layoffs.....	285
Layoffs Under PERM	286
Conclusion	291
When Is a Job Clearly Open? Towards a Unified Theory of 20 CFR §656.10(c)(8)	293
History.....	293
Scope.....	294
Purpose, Standard, and Application.....	294
Recent Developments	295
Successful Defense	297
Conclusion	298
Lawful, Job-Related Reasons an Employer Can Use to Reject an Applicant	299
Introduction.....	299
Increased Risk and Scrutiny by the DOJ/IER in 2026.....	299
Lack of Major Requirement and No Alternative Field of Study or Alternative Combination of Education and Experience Accepted.....	299
When a Duty Arises to Conduct Further Inquiry	300
Perform Job Opportunities During a Reasonable Period of On-the-Job Training	301
Lack of Experience Is a Lawful Reason for Rejecting Applicants.....	301
Unwillingness to Accept Offered Wage.....	302
Specific Job Requirements Must Be Explicit	302
Proper Documentation for Rejection	302
Conclusion	303

Form ETA-9089 and Filing Through FLAG

Drafting PERM Applications to Ensure I-140 Approval	305
Introduction.....	305
The Foreign National Needs to Meet the Requirements as Stated on the Form ETA-9089.....	305
The Foreign National Must Prove They Meet Every Requirement.....	306
Education Requirements.....	306
Education Documentation	307
Credentials Evaluation.....	307
Training Documentation.....	307
Experience Documentation	308
Employer Unavailability.....	308
Documentation of Special or Specific Requirements.....	309
Acceptability of Foreign Degrees.....	309
Degree Equivalencies in the PERM and I-140 Context	309
EB-3 Classification.....	310
EB-2 Classification	311
Master’s Degree.....	311
Bachelor’s Degree + Five.....	311
Progressive Experience.....	312
Three-for-One Equivalencies.....	313
Defining a Related Degree.....	313
The Foreign National Must Meet the Requirements of Forms ETA-9141 and ETA-9089 at the	
Time of Filing.....	313
Anticipating a Promotion or Other Changes in the Job.....	314
Employer Information.....	314
Employer’s Name and FEIN	315
Employer’s Address.....	315
Signature.....	315
Changing Worksite Locations	316
The Employer Moves	316
The Employee’s Worksite Location Changes	316
Roving Employees.....	316
Prevailing Wage/Ability to Pay	317
Conclusion	318
Anatomy of Form ETA-9089: An Item-by-Item Discussion	319
Getting to the Current Form ETA-9089.....	319
Introduction/History	319
Preparing the Form ETA-9089—Item by Item.....	320
Instructions for the Form	320
When to Use This Form.....	321
Preliminary Questions on the Form ETA-9089.....	321
Supervised Recruitment (Paper Form Item H.a)	321

Occupation Type (Paper Form Item H.b).....	322
Professional Occupation (Which Includes a College or University Teacher Not Selected Using Competitive Recruitment Process (Paper Form Item H.b.1a).....	322
Nonprofessional Occupation Type (Paper Form Item H.b.1b)	322
College or University Teacher and the Candidate Was Selected Using Competitive Recruitment (Paper Form Item H.b.1c).....	322
Schedule A or Sheepherder (Paper Form Item H.b.1d)	322
Professional Athlete (Paper Form Item H.b.1e).....	323
Section A: Employer Information	323
Items A.1 and A.2: Legal Business Name/ Trade Name/DBA	323
Items A.3 Through A.9: Employer Address.....	323
Items A.10 and A.11: Employer Telephone Number	324
Item A.12: Federal Employer Identification Number (FEIN) from IRS	324
Item A.13: NAICS Code	324
Item A.14: Number of Employees in the Area of Intended Employment	324
Item A.15: Year Commenced Business.....	325
Item A.16: Is the Employer a Closely Held Corporation, Partnership, or Sole Proprietorship in Which the Foreign Worker Has an Ownership Interest?.....	325
Item A.17: Is There a Familial Relationship Between the Foreign Worker and the Owners, Stockholders, Partners, Corporate Officers, and/or Incorporators?.....	325
Section B: Employer Point of Contact.....	326
Items B.1 Through B.11: Contact's Name, Job Title, and Address	326
Items B.12 Through B.14: Contact Information, Telephone Number, and Email Address	326
Section C: Attorney or Agent Information	326
Section D: Foreign Worker Information.....	327
Item D.1: Completed Appendix A Attached?	327
Item D.2: Has the Employer Contracted with an Agent or Attorney That Also Represents the Foreign Worker Covered by This Application?	327
Section E: Job Opportunity and Wage Information.....	327
Item E.1: Prevailing Wage Determination Case Number.....	327
Item E.2: If a Valid PWD Has Not Been Obtained Due to the Employer Being Required to Undergo Supervised Recruitment, Indicate Whether a Completed Form ETA-9141 Is Attached to This Application.	327
Items E.3 and E.4: Offered Wage.....	328
Item E.5: Additional Conditions About the Offered Wage (Limited to 500 Characters)	328
Section F: Area of Intended Employment (Worksite Information).....	328
Items F.a Through F.c: Worksite Information (Where Work Is to Be Performed).....	328
Multiple Worksites.....	330
Regions.....	331
Section G: Additional Job Opportunity Information and Other Requirements	331
Item G.1: Is This a Permanent Position Offering Full-Time Employment of Generally 35 Hours or More?	331

Item G.2: Is the Employer Seeking Labor Certification for Live-In Household Domestic Service Worker?	331
Item G.3: Employer Willing to Accept Foreign Diploma/Degree?	332
Item G.4: Foreign Worker Currently Working for Employer?	332
Item G.5: Is the Employer Relying Solely on Experience the Foreign Worker Gained with the Employer?.....	333
Note on Items G.6 Through G.12: When Appendix C, Supplemental Information Must Be Completed	334
Item G.6: Does the Job Require the Worker to Live on the Employer's Premises?	335
Item G.7: Does the Job Involve a Combination of Occupations?	335
Item G.8: Foreign Language Required or Preferred?	335
Item G.9: Do the Job Requirements Exceed the Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) Level?	336
Item G.10: Did the Employer Use a Credentialing Service to Qualify the Foreign National for the Job Opportunity?	338
Item G.11: Has the Employer Received Payment of Any Kind for the Submission of This Application?	339
Item G.12: Has the Employer Had a Layoff in the Area in the Occupation or Related Occupation within Six Months Preceding the Filing of This Application in the Area of Intended Employment?.....	340
Section H: Recruitment Information	341
Items H.c.1a. and H.c.1b: Start/End Dates for SWA Job Order.....	341
Items H.c.2 Through H.c.3: Is There a Sunday Edition of the Newspaper (of General Circulation) in the Area of Intended Employment?	343
Item H.d: Additional Recruitment Requirements for Professional Occupations Under 20 CFR §656.17(e)(ii)	344
Date Advertised at Job Fair.....	344
Dates Posted on Employer's Website	344
Dates Listed with Job Search Website	345
Dates of On-Campus Recruiting	345
Dates Advertised with Trade or Professional Organizations	345
Dates Listed with Private Employment Firm.....	346
Dates Advertised with Employee Referral Program	346
Dates Advertised with Campus Placement Office	347
Dates Advertised with Local or Ethnic Newspaper	347
Dates Advertised with Radio or TV	348
Item H.e: Notice of Posting (Filing).....	348
Item H.e.1a Bargaining Representative.....	348
Item H.e.1b: No Bargaining Representative–Physical Notice	349
Item H.e.1c: No Bargaining Representative–Electronic Notice.....	350
Item H.e.1d: No Bargaining Representative–In-House Notice.....	350
Item H.e.1e: No Bargaining Representative–Private Household.....	350
Item H.e.1f: The Employer DID NOT Post the Notice of Filing.....	350

Section I: Employer Labor Condition Statements/Attestations	350
Section J: Preparer	351
Appendix A: Foreign Worker Information	351
Appendix A.A: Foreign Worker Contact Information	352
Appendix A.B: Foreign Worker Education	352
Appendix A.C: Foreign Worker's Training, Certification(s), and/or License(s) Information	353
Appendix A.D: Foreign Worker's Skills, Abilities, Proficiencies	353
Appendix A.E: Foreign Worker's Work Experience	345
Appendix B: Additional Worksite Information	354
Appendix C: Supplemental Information	354
Appendix D: Special Recruitment for College and University Teachers Under 20 CFR §656.18	355
Appendix D.1: Date Foreign Worker Selected for the Position	355
Appendix D.2 Through D.4: Name of National Professional Journal, Educational Organizational Publication, or Other Publication in Which Advertisement Placed, with Start Date of Advertisement	355
Appendix D.5: Specify Additional Recruitment	356
Submission of Form ETA-9089 in FLAG	356
Audit of Form ETA-9089	356
Form ETA-9089 Final Determination: Permanent Employment Labor Certification Approval	356
Item A: For Government Use Only	356
Item B: Foreign Worker Declaration	357
Item C: Attorney or Agent Declaration	357
Item D: Employer Declaration	357
Post Adjudication and Other Issues	357
Withdrawal of Form ETA-9089 in the FLAG System	357
Withdrawal of Legacy ETA Form-9089 and Refiling	357
Multiple Filings	359
Validity Period	359
Amendments	360
Employer Reorganization	360
Request for Duplicate Certified Form ETA-9089	360
Attachment A: Prevailing Wage Guidance Chart of Impact on Job Requirements on Wage Levels	361
Attachment B: Comparison of SVP and O*NET Guidelines for Education and Experience Requirements	362
Attachment C: Important DOL Email Addresses	363

Post-Filing, Audits, and Enforcement

Worst-Case Scenarios: Revocation, Invalidation, Debarment, Suspension, Appeal, and the Paramount Importance of Document Retention	365
Introduction.....	365
Labor Certification Determination.....	366
Supervised Recruitment.....	367
Revocation of Approved Labor Certification	368
Invalidation of Labor Certification	369
Suspension and Debarment.....	369
Appeal to the Board of Alien Labor Certification Appeals	370
Document Retention	371
Conclusion.....	372
Conquering the Maze of Supervised Recruitment: An Overview	373
Introduction.....	373
What Is SR and Why Was My Case Placed in SR?.....	373
Overview of the SR Process	374
Common SR Issues and Pitfalls	376
Managing Employer Expectations.....	376
Deadlines and Technical Issues	377
Recent Developments at BALCA.....	378
Conclusion	379
Appendix 1: Notification of Supervised Recruitment.....	380
Appendix 2: Recruitment Instructions	386
Appendix 3: Recruitment Report Instructions	392
PERM Audits: Trump’s Increasing Scrutiny and Biden’s Enforcement Priorities—Opponents Align	397
Introduction.....	397
What Is a PERM Audit?	398
Types of PERM Audits.....	400
Preparing for a Random Audit: Compiling the Audit Package Before Filing the Application	400
General Documentation Requests Contained in Most or All Audits.....	401
Recruitment Documentation.....	402
Whether to Include SWA Job Order Documentation in the Audit Response.....	403
Preparing the Recruitment Report	404
Preparing Business Necessity Documentation	405
Strategies for Remediating Errors in the Context of a PERM Audit.....	407
Errors on the Form ETA-9089	407
Strategies for Remediating Missing Documentation in the Context of a PERM Audit	407
Audits Requesting Copies of Applicant Résumés	408
Demonstrating U.S. Worker Applicants Could Not Obtain Missing Skills Through On-the-Job Training	409

Audits Requesting Evidence That There Have Been No Improper Payments by the Employer or Foreign National.....	409
Audit Triggers: Anticipating and Preparing for Specific Requests Contained in Targeted Audit Notices	409
Proof of Business Necessity	410
Requirements Exceeding the SVP Level for the Occupation.....	410
Foreign Language Requirement	411
Documentation That the Employer's Alternative Requirements Are "Substantially Equivalent" to the Primary Requirements for the Job Opportunity	412
Degree Equivalencies	412
Documentation That Experience Gained with the Sponsoring Employer Is "Not Substantially Comparable" to the Position Specified on the Application, or That It Is No Longer Feasible for the Employer to Train a Worker for the Position.....	413
Documentation of Compliance with Layoff Requirements.....	414
Employee Referral Programs.....	415
Live-In Domestic Workers	416
Improvements for the PERM Audit Program.....	416
Conclusion	417
To File or Not to File: Strategies for Carrying a PERM Through the Final Act of Appellate Review	419
Assessing the Case.....	420
Requests for Reconsideration	420
Request for BALCA Review	421
Is a Request for Review the Best Option?	422
Preparing Your Request for Reconsideration to the CO or Request for BALCA Review	423
Regulatory Requirements	423
Strategic Considerations	424
Recommendations for Drafting the Request for Reconsideration or Review.....	424
Heading	424
Statement of the Case	425
Standard of Review	425
Jurisdiction	425
Argument.....	425
Conclusion.....	426
Closing Thoughts.....	426
Appendix 1: Sample Audit Notification	427
Appendix 2: Sample Response to Audit Notification.....	430
Appendix 3: Sample PERM Denial Notice.....	435
Appendix 4: Sample Request for Reconsideration	437

Schedule A and Special Handling

Schedule A, Group I: Immigrant Options Available to Health Care Workers—Physical Therapists and Professional Nurses	441
Introduction.....	441
Definition of Schedule A, Group I Occupations.....	442
Physical Therapist	442
Professional Nurse.....	442
Steps to Successfully Prepare a Schedule A, Group I Petition....	442
Step 1: Building the Foundation for the Physical Therapist or Professional Nurse Petition.....	442
Regulations	442
20 CFR §656.15(b):	442
Prevailing Wage Determination Application	443
Notice of Filing.....	443
Health Care Certificate	443
Regulations	444
8 CFR 212.15(f):	444
Step 2: Preparation and Submission of Schedule A, Group I Petitions	445
Specific Documentation Required for Each Occupation....	445
Physical Therapists	445
Regulations	445
20 CFR §656.15(c)(1):	445
Education Requirements.....	446
Licensure and Credentialing.....	446
Health Care Certification.....	446
Streamlined Certification Process	446
Professional Nurses	447
Education Requirements.....	447
Licensure and Credentialing.....	447
Health Care Certificate Alternatives	447
Streamlined Certification Process	448
Documents Required for Filing a Schedule A, Group I Petition....	448
Conclusion....	449
Checklist for a Schedule A, Group I Immigrant Petition—Physical Therapist....	450
Checklist for a Schedule A, Group I Immigrant Petition—Professional Nurse	451

Schedule A, Group II: Immigrant Visa Standards and Practice Tips	453
Introduction.....	453
DOL Regulations	453
The Legal Standard for Arts and Sciences	454
Prong 1: Widespread Acclaim and International Recognition Accorded by Recognized Experts	455
Prong 2: Confirmation That the Foreign National's Work During the Past Year Did, and Intended Work Will, Require Exceptional Ability	455
Prong 3: Confirmation That the Foreign National Meets at Least Two Regulatory Criteria	456
The Legal Standard for Performing Arts	458
Additional DOL Requirements	459
"International" Legal Standard	459
Form ETA-9089.....	459
Posting Notice Requirement	459
Prevailing Wage Determination	460
Meeting the USCIS Requirements.....	460
Second-Preference Employment-Based Immigrant Visa	460
Third-Preference Employment-Based Immigrant Visa	462
Conclusion	463
Appendix A: Schedule A, Group II Chart.....	464
Special Handling: The Competitive Edge	465
Sources	465
Statute	465
Regulations	466
Technical Assistance Guide.....	466
FAQs.....	466
Technology and Modernization Efforts: FLAG	466
Special Handling Advantages and Challenges.....	467
Institutions Can Use Their Real-World Recruitment and Streamline Labor Certification Sponsorship	468
Special Handling Is Relatively Streamlined, Even with Reselection	468
Special Handling Challenges.....	469
Establishing Model Practices Can Streamline Special Handling Cases.....	470
Qualifying Institutions and Positions.....	470
Positions That Qualify for Special Handling	471
What Constitutes <i>Classroom</i> Teaching	472
Combination of Occupations	472
Special Handling Requirements and the Step-by-Step Process	473
Step 1: Obtain Foreign Worker's Date of Selection to Determine the Filing Deadline	473
Date of Selection for a Reselection Case	474
Step 2: Verify that the Institution Recruited in the Required Sources.....	475
Print Journals	476
Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journals.....	476

What Constitutes an Acceptable Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journal?	477
<i>Chronicle of Higher Education</i>	477
Ads on Websites of National Professional Academic Associations	477
Insiderhighered.com and Higherjobs.com.....	477
Is a One-Day Print Advertisement in a National Professional Journal, or One 30-Day Online Ad in an Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journal Enough?.....	479
Form ETA-9089: Appendix D.....	480
Step 3. Ad Content, Beneficiary Qualifications, and Rejecting U.S. Workers	480
Challenges in Institutional Advertising Practices.....	481
Impact of <i>Matter of East Tennessee State</i>	481
Basic vs. Special Handling: Minimum Education Requirements/Use of Preferences in Ads	481
All but Dissertation (ABD)	482
Ad and Form Consistency	483
Experience: Applicable and (Non)Ambiguous Requirements	484
The Institution Must Show That the Selected Foreign Worker Is More Qualified Than Each U.S. Worker Who Applied for the Job	484
The Foreign Worker Must Satisfy Advertised Requirements	485
Step 4. Obtain the Selection Committee's Report	486
Step 5. Obtain the Hiring Official's Statement to Verify That the Institution Engaged in a "Competitive Recruitment and Selection Process"	487
Hiring Authority's Statement Attesting to Foreign Worker's Education and Qualifications	489
Step 6: Drafting Labor Certification (Form ETA-9089) for Special Handling Processing.....	489
PERM Job Opportunity and Wage Information.....	489
Job Duties and Requirements	489
Education Requirements.....	489
Training, Special Skills, or Other Requirements.....	490
Other Special Skills or Requirements.....	490
Experience in an Alternate Occupation	490
Job Duties	491
Foreign Language Requirement	491
Recruitment Information (Form ETA-9089 Preliminary Questions and Appendix D).....	491
Occupation Type	491
Special Recruitment and Documentation Procedures for College and University Teachers	491
Foreign Worker Information (Form ETA-9089 Appendix A.A–A.E)	492
Foreign Worker Contact Information—Appendix A.A	492
Foreign Worker Education—Appendix A.B.....	492
Foreign Worker Training Questions—Appendix A.C	492
Foreign Worker Skills—Appendix A.D.....	492
Foreign Worker Experience—Appendix A.E	492
Step 7. Obtain the Required Prevailing Wage Determination	492
Determining the Appropriate Source.....	493

Sources Other than the OES Survey	495
PWD Should Be Valid/Unexpired on Date Special Handling Case Filed Under	
20 CFR §656.18.....	495
Step 8: Provide the Appropriate Notice of Filing	496
Step 9: Assemble the Compliance File.....	498
Step 10: Submit the Special Handling Application	498
Step 11: Provide the Institution with the Compliance File for Its Maintenance.....	499
When Special Handling Based on the Original Search Cannot or Should Not Be Pursued	499
The “Reselection Procedure,” or the Basic Labor Certification Process.....	499
When Another Process May Be More Advantageous	500
When the Processing Times Suggest That Another Process Is Advisable: The Visa Number	
Unavailability Problem.....	500
The EB-1 Outstanding Professor Petition and the EB-1 Extraordinary Ability Petition.....	501
The Schedule A, Group II Process	501
Conclusion	502

Practice Aids and References

Appendix 1 Chart to Verify Foreign National's and Derivatives' Admissibility

<i>Before Taking a Case</i>	503
Appendix 2 Sample Letters, Checklists, Memos, Charts, and Other Practice Aids	527
Template 1: PERM Labor Certification Checklist.....	531
Template 2: Memorandum Regarding Labor Certification	533
Template 3: Form of Engagement Letter Content	537
Template 4: Form of Dual Representation Letter	539
Template 5: Employer Intake (All Employers).....	543
Template 6: Job Description/Minimum Requirements Document	545
Template 7: Employer Intake (Small Employers)	549
Template 8: Set Up An Account on DOL's FLAG System.....	551
Template 9: Employee Intake	553
Template 10: Employee Qualification Checklist	563
Template 11: Experience, Skill, and Degree-Focus Confirmation Statements.....	565
Template 12: Sample Business Necessity Questions for Employer	569
Template 13: Business Necessity Memorandum	571
Template 14: Notice of Filing.....	575
Template 15: PERM Advertising Efforts Chart.....	577
Template 16: Recruitment Calculation Timeline.....	579
Template 17: Recruitment Instruction Memorandum.....	581
Template 18: Audit File Cover Sheet and Index.....	593
Template 19: Recruitment Report.....	595
Template 20: Prefiling Review Request Correspondence	597
Template 21: Postfiling Memorandum to File.....	599
Template 22: PERM Document Retention Checklist	601

Template 23: Form of Employer Filing Confirmation Correspondence to Employer.....	603
Template 24: Postfiling Correspondence Regarding Status of Case and Processing-Time.....	605
Template 25: Form of Audit Response Letter	607
Subject-Matter Index	611